| 1 2 3 4 5 | Michael Songer (SBN 175560) michael.songer@whitecase.com WHITE & CASE LLP 701 Thirteenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20006 Telephone: (202) 626-3600 Facsimile: (202) 639-9355 Sebastian Zonte (SBN 341609) sebastian.zonte@whitecase.com | | |
|-----------------------|--|------------------------------|--|
| 6 | WHITE & CASE LLP 555 S. Flower St. Ste. 2700 | | |
| 7 | Los Angeles, CA 90071 Telephone: (213) 620-7798 Facsimile: (213) 678-0758 | | |
| 8 | | | |
| 9 | Hallie Kiernan (SBN 313541) hallie kiernan @whitecase.com | | |
| 10 | WHITE & CASE LLP 1221 Avenue of the Americas | | |
| 11 | New York, NY 10020 Telephone: (212) 819-8200 Facsimile: (212) 354-8113 | | |
| 12 | Facsimile: (212) 534-8115 | | |
| 13 | Attorneys for ANNA BIANI | | |
| 14 | UNITED STATES | DISTRICT COURT | |
| 15 | UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA | | |
| 16 | WESTERN DIVISION | | |
| 17 | VV ESTER | (DIVIOIO | |
| 18 | ANNA BIANI, | Case No. 2:23-cv-03845 | |
| 19 20 | Plaintiff, | COMPLAINT FOR: | |
| 21 | v. | 1. COPYRIGHT | |
| 22 | SHOWTIME NETWORKS, INC., a | INFRINGEMENT | |
| 23 | Delaware corporation, SHOWTIME DIGITAL, INC., a Delaware | 2. CONTRIBUTORY COPYRIGHT | |
| 24 | corporation, JOHN LOGAN, DAVID NEVINS, and DOES 1 and 2, individuals, | INFRINGEMENT 3 DECLARATORY | |
| 25 | Defendants. | 3. DECLARATORY JUDGMENT | |
| 26 | Defendants. | 4. ACCOUNTING | |
| 27 | | DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL | |
| 28 | | _1 | |

Case 2:23-cv-03845 Document 1 Filed 05/18/23 Page 1 of 31 Page ID #:1

- 1 -

Plaintiff ANNA BIANI ("Biani" or "Plaintiff"), by and through her undersigned counsel, for her complaint against Defendants SHOWTIME NETWORKS, INC., SHOWTIME DIGITAL, INC. (collectively with Showtime Networks, Inc., "Showtime"), JOHN LOGAN, DAVID NEVINS and DOES 1 and 2 (collectively, "Defendants"), alleges as follows:

6

NATURE OF THE ACTION

- 7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

- This action seeks to recover damages and other remedies for copyright 1. infringement.
- In 2014, the television series *Penny Dreadful* began airing on Showtime 2. On Demand, Showtime Anytime and several other platforms. The series wove together stories set in 19th Century London involving canonical characters from Victorian Gothic fiction, including Dorian Gray from Oscar Wilde's The Picture of Dorian Gray, Mina Harker and Count Dracula from Bram Stoker's Dracula, and Victor Frankenstein and his Monster from Mary Shelley's Frankenstein. The series was an immediate hit and went on to win multiple awards and accolades, including a 2014 Critic's Choice Award for Most Exciting New Series as well as multiple Emmy nominations, before its final episode aired in 2016.
- While Penny Dreadful included several public domain characters from 3. the Victorian-era literary cannon, two of the central characters of the series were purportedly new ones: Vanessa Ives and Sir Malcolm Murray. Their story forms the main arc of *Penny Dreadful*. The copyright infringement claims in this case focus on the character of Vanessa Ives in the story told by Penny Dreadful.
- 4. Vanessa Ives, played by the award-winning actress Eva Green, is the central protagonist of the show. Vanessa is a strong, seductive and alluring woman, in her late twenties or early thirties, who dresses in elegant, refined black clothing with high collars, or in low-cut evening wear, and has a mysterious and enigmatic presence. She is portrayed as possessing a supernatural power that allows her to communicate with the otherworld through violent, convulsive experiences akin to

seizures. Vanessa is friendly and courteous but also capable of an unspeakable evil. She is depicted as a sexually provocative character, having trysts with multiple characters on the show, including a stranger in the streets of London. Vanessa is an unusually independent Victorian era woman who travels to the darkest and most dangerous places in London on her own. She also possesses a comprehensive knowledge of plants and their healing powers and is frequently depicted smoking cannabis.

- 5. Sir Malcolm Murray, played by Timothy Dalton, is a British explorer who has recently returned to London from Africa after having spent many years away from his family. Sir Malcolm is a man in his sixties who dresses in brown suits and vests, a black tie and a bowler hat and carries a gold pocket-watch. Upon his return to London, he learns that his daughter, Mina, is missing. Sir Malcolm suspects that Mina has been taken by evil forces and he enlists Vanessa to use her powers of clairvoyance to help him find Mina. Mina and Vanessa had been best friends since they were children, until the day Vanessa caught Sir Malcolm having sex with Vanessa's mother, an event that caused Vanessa, in retaliation, to seduce Mina's fiancé on the eve of their wedding. Sir Malcolm uses these tragic events in their common past as leverage to pressure Vanessa to help him on his quest to find Mina.
- 6. The search by Vanessa and Sir Malcolm to find Mina is the common plot element that binds together all other stories and characters in *Penny Dreadful*. During the course of this search, Vanessa and Sir Malcolm encounter Dorian Gray (whom Vanessa seduces), Dr. Frankenstein and his Monster (whom Vanessa knew before he was brought back to life), Count Dracula (to whom Vanessa falls prey), and others, including an American marksman and roadshow artist named Ethan Chandler (who assists Vanessa and Sir Malcolm on their quest). During a key scene in Season 1, Episode Two of *Penny Dreadful*, Vanessa and Sir Malcom attend a séance during which Vanessa experiences what appears to be an epileptic seizure and, while in a trance-like state, channels spirts that speak through her about past

events in Sir Malcom's life relevant to his search for Mina. In Season 1, Episode Five, we learn that after Vanessa's sexual encounter with Mina's fiancé, Vanessa descended into a dark state and was initially treated for epilepsy due to her seizures, but was later taken to an asylum where she was lobotomized to treat her extreme sexual tendencies and her possession by evil spirits. In Season 2 of *Penny Dreadful*, we learn that Vanessa is in fact a witch.

- Throughout the three seasons of *Penny Dreadful*, Vanessa Ives remains its central protagonist, and the true nature and source of Vanessa's mysterious powers and her struggles to understand the forces of good and evil within her forms the central question of the show, which is not answered until the final episode. Indeed, so central was Vanessa Ives to *Penny Dreadful* that the creator of the series, John Logan, and one of its executive producers, David Nevins, stated that once they had decided the character of Vanessa would meet her death, they knew the series had reached its natural end, because Penny Dreadful "was a show about Vanessa Ives." 1
- 8. John Logan and the writers and producers of *Penny Dreadful* were not, however, the original creators of Vanessa Ives or her story.
- In 2011, more than three years before Penny Dreadful first aired, Anna 9. Biani, the Plaintiff is this action ("Biani" or "Plaintiff"), joined an online role-paying community called "Murders & Roses: Victorian London Crime and Scandals" ("Murders & Roses").² Murders & Roses was a creative-writing platform that enabled its members to choose a Victorian-era character and develop London-based, crime-related plot-lines around that character, including by interacting with other members' characters. Members could choose from a list of pre-selected canonical characters for their plotting, which included Dorian Gray, Victor Frankenstein, Count Dracula, Mina Harker, and other canonical Victorian characters common to *Penny*

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

¹ "Creator John Logan and Showtime's David Nevins on the Decision to 'End' Penny Dreadful," *Variety*, June 20, 2016 (emphasis added). https://murdersandroses.proboards.com/

- Dreadful. Alternatively, members could choose to develop plots using their own original characters. If a member chose to use an original character, that character needed to be approved by the moderators of Murders & Roses, two of whom went by the names "Lord Charles Carmichael" and "Dorian Gray." The moderators required members to make posts each week to maintain their active membership in Murders & Roses, and regularly reminded members of this requirement.
- 10. Between 2011 and 2013, Biani made more than one thousand posts to Murders & Roses. In these posts, she created at least fifteen original characters, all approved by the Murders & Roses moderators, and developed plot-lines based on them.
- 11. One of Biani's original characters was a violent and mysterious woman named Charlotte Benoit. Biani depicted Charlotte as a woman in her early thirties who, like Vanessa Ives, typically dressed in a dark jacket and matching skirt, with a high-collared shirt and veiled top-hat, and who would don extravagant gowns with low-cut décolletages for special evenings. Charlotte is seductive and controlling, and uses her charm to manipulate others to get what she wants. Like Vanessa Ives, Charlotte could be feminine, courteous, and well-mannered when she needed to gain the trust of others, but she also flaunted tradition by exhibiting behavior more typical of a Victorian man than a woman, such as smoking cannabis in public or participating in archery and hunting. Charlotte is debauched and wicked, with extreme sexual perversions, and draws pleasure from corrupting others or even killing them, with no remorse. Charlotte developed a fascination with the occult from an early age, which ultimately led her to describe herself to others as a witch doctor, or a "green witch," who, like Vanessa Ives, specializes in harnessing the magical powers of plants.
- 12. Members of the Murders & Roses community were required by the moderators of the site to identify the actor who they felt could portray their characters. For Charlotte, Biani chose the actress Eva Green. Biani used images of Eva Green from the Internet to depict the distinctive appearance and physical

characteristics of Charlotte on Murders & Roses. Of course, three years later Eva Green was selected to play the lead character in *Penny Dreadful*.

- 13. Another of Biani's original characters on Murders & Roses was named Frederick FitzClarence. Biani described Frederick as an aristocratic man in his midtwenties. From a young age, Frederick experienced macabre thoughts that neither he nor his parents understood. One day, however, Frederick experienced a grand-mal epileptic seizure in the presence of a priest who concluded that Frederick, much like Vanessa Ives (the *Penny Dreadful* character), was possessed by demons. Frederick was removed from his family in an attempt to protect them and, like Vanessa Ives, was institutionalized, but after Frederick had a sexual encounter with an older nurse, the priests concluded that Frederick was the "devil's child" and a source of evil. He was later removed from the priests' care by an uncle who took him to London, where Frederick assumed the role of impostor, pretending to be whatever would gain him the most attention from others and hiding his true identity, and in the process lost his true self in his struggle with evil.
- 14. A third original character that Biani developed for Murders & Roses was named Landon Lloyd. Like Sir Malcolm Murray in *Penny Dreadful*, Landon was an explorer of the globe whose travels included Africa. He wore a brown pinstripe sack coat and pinstripe pants, a vest, a white dress shirt, a bowler hat, and a black tie and carried a gold pocket watch. Landon underwent a near death experience at an early age after being lost in a forest and from that time developed an ability to foretell future events through premonition. After many years of leading a nomadic existence, Landon decided to settle in London to work as a private investigator and ultimately embarked on a search for his half-sister, Irene Adler, who, identical to the plot in *Penny Dreadful*, had gone missing. Landon employed his special power of clairvoyance in his search, much as Sir Malcom relied on the same powers of Vanessa Ives in his search for Mina in *Penny Dreadful*.

- 6 -

Biani's distinctive and specifically delineated characters Charlotte,

Frederick and Landon are protected by copyright. Among other things, they

comprise the very "story being told" in Anna's works on Murders & Roses. Biani is,

and at all relevant times has been, the owner of a valid copyright in and to her original

characters Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon, including material associated with

Copyright Registration Nos. TX0009259135, TX0009259146, TX0009259151

TX0009262305, TX000926858, TX0009262879, TX0009262872, TX0009262877,

TX0009262886, and TX0009262867. Each of these copyright registrations are

15.

attached hereto as Exhibits A-J.

- 16. Defendants infringed Biani's copyright in her original characters by incorporating them into *Penny Dreadful* in the guise of Vanessa Ives, who, among other traits, embodies the physical attributes, personality and connection to witchcraft of Charlotte Benoit; the affliction with epilepsy and connection to evil of Frederick FitzClarence; and the special clairvoyance powers of Landon Lloyd.
- 17. In addition, Defendants infringed Biani's copyright in her original characters by incorporating them into *Penny Dreadful* in the guise of Sir Malcolm Murray, a nomadic explorer like Landon Lloyd, who enlists the powers of clairvoyance in his quest to find his missing family member.

THE PARTIES

- 18. Plaintiff Anna Biani is an individual who resided in Los Angeles, California from at least 2010 until 2022 and now resides in Tbilisi, Georgia. Plaintiff is the owner of registered copyrights in the character descriptions and other original works involving Charlotte Benoit, Frederick FitzClarence and Landon Lloyd that she posted to Murders & Roses between 2011 and 2013.
- 19. Defendant Showtime Networks, Inc. is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware, is registered to do business in California, and has offices located at 10880 Wilshire Blvd, Suite 1600, Los Angeles, California 90024. Upon information and belief, Showtime owns and operates the

- premium television networks SHOWTIME® and SHOWTIME ANYTIME® as well as the streaming service SHOWTIME ON DEMAND®, each of which have broadcasted and continue to broadcast and/or display to the public *Penny Dreadful* without Plaintiff's permission or credit to Plaintiff.
- 20. Defendant Showtime Digital, Inc., is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the state of Delaware. Upon further information and belief, Showtime Digital, Inc. is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Showtime Networks, Inc. that operates the stand-alone streaming service SHOWTIME®, through which it steams Penny Dreadful without Plaintiff's permission or credit to Plaintiff.
- 21. Defendant John Logan is credited as the creator and writer of *Penny Dreadful*.
- 22. Defendant David Nevins is credited as an executive producer of *Penny Dreadful*. Until 2022, Nevins was the Chairman and Chief Executive Officer of Showtime.
- 23. The true names of Defendants named herein as Does 1 and 2 are not now known to Plaintiff. Doe 1 used the pseudonym "Lord Charles Carmichael" and Doe 2 used the pseudonym "Dorian Gray" on the Murders & Roses website. Plaintiff is informed and believes, and on that basis alleges, that each of the Defendants resides in the state of California and/or are otherwise subject to the jurisdiction of this Court, are legally responsible for the wrongful acts herein alleged and are subject to the relief requested herein. If necessary, Plaintiff will amend this complaint to state the true names and capacities of those Defendants when such information has been ascertained.

JURISDICTION

24. Jurisdiction over the parties and subject matter of this action is proper in this Court pursuant to 17 U.S.C. § 101 *et seq*. (actions arising under the Copyright Act), 28. U.S.C. § 1331 (actions arising under the laws of the United States), and § 1338(a) (actions arising under an Act of Congress relating to copyrights).

- 25. This Court has personal jurisdiction over Defendant Showtime Networks, Inc., because it has conducted and, upon information and belief, continues to conduct business in California and in this judicial district. Moreover, upon further information and belief, Showtime Networks, Inc. has transacted and continues to transact business throughout the United States and in this judicial district by advertising, exploiting, distributing, broadcasting, and streaming *Penny Dreadful* to audiences in this judicial district.
- 26. This Court has personal jurisdiction over Defendant Showtime Digital, Inc. because it has conducted and continues to conduct business in California and in this judicial district. Moreover, upon further information and belief, Showtime Digital, Inc. has transacted and continues to transact business in the United States and in this judicial district by advertising, exploiting, distributing, broadcasting, and streaming Penny Dreadful to customers in this judicial district.
- 27. This Court has personal jurisdiction over Defendant John Logan because Logan resides in this judicial district and/or has transacted and continues to transact business in this judicial district and has committed unlawful acts both within and outside of California causing injury in California. Plaintiff's claims arise out of the conduct that gives rise to personal jurisdiction over Defendant Logan.
- 28. This Court has personal jurisdiction over Defendant David Nevins because Nevins resides in this judicial district and/or has transacted and continues to transact business in this judicial district and has committed unlawful acts both within and outside of California causing injury in California. Plaintiff's claims arise out of the conduct that gives rise to personal jurisdiction over Defendant Nevins.
- 29. This Court has jurisdiction over Defendants Does 1 and 2 because they reside in this district and/or have transacted and continue to transact business in this judicial district and have committed unlawful acts both within and outside of California causing injury in California. Plaintiff's claims arise out of the conduct that gives rise to personal jurisdiction over Defendants Does 1 and 2.

VENUE

30. Venue is proper in this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(1) and (2) because a substantial part of the events giving rise to Plaintiff's claims occurred herein and because certain Defendants reside in California and in this judicial district.

FACTS COMMON TO ALL CLAIMS

The Murders & Roses Role Playing Forum

- 31. Role-playing forums are popular websites that allow their users to select and develop characters relating to a certain theme and to interact with other characters in the forum by making posts to a thread. A thread is a line of posts through which users are able to engage their characters in dialogue and develop plot-lines around a single theme or idea. Many role-playing forums took their inspiration from early table-top role-playing games, such as Dungeons & Dragons, Empire of the Petal Throne, and Call of Cthulhu.
- 32. In or around January 2011, an advertisement appeared in various online role-playing communities for a new role-playing forum entitled: "Murders & Roses." The setting of the forum was a Victorian-era London shaken by crime and civil unrest, and the forum characters included well-known figures like Sherlock Holmes, Jack the Ripper, Dorian Gray, Dr. Jekyll, Victor Frankenstein, and Sweeny Todd. The ad noted that the creators of the forum were "looking for canons and originals."
- 33. Below is a reproduction of one such advertisement, which was posted to a forum entitled "In the Midnight Hour Active Canine RP" by a user named "Dorian Gray" on January 8, 2011.

Murders & Roses

In the darkest streets of London lurks a mysterious killer. A spurious impression of prosperity hides poverty and crime from the eyes of the rich and of the idle, as well as from the industrious bourgeoisie, caught as they are in a tangled web of intrigues and affairs, their mind full with the constant whirl of sumptuous parties. London is like a double-edged sword, only reunited at nights, when murders and mysteries are as thick as the swirling fog.

The conflict and arguments between the haves and the have nots is swelling in London and while Scotland Yard, helped by the whimsical Mr. Holmes, struggles to solve a trail of inexplicable cases, the reign of Her majesty the Queen is shaken to its very core by social agitation.

Mysterious deaths mix with social events, love stories are splattered with blood, and from above this general confusion rise anguishing figures, murderers, like the tainted Ripper or his new female counter part, the Scarlet rose, eerie dandies, like the un-aging Dorian Gray, mad scientists, like the doctors Jekyll and Frankenstein, good men gone mad with grief, such as Sweeney Todd, the demonic barber of Fleet Street, with their cohorts or admirers, debauched and diseased artists, courtesans and prostitutes, thieves and beggars.

we are looking for canons and originals!

- 34. The rules of the Murders & Roses forum required new users to submit an application to join the forum, which was subject to approval by the forum moderators before a user was permitted to make posts to the forum. Among other things, the forum required applicants "to be as literate as possible." Once a user's application was accepted, there was no limit to how many characters a user could introduce to the forum except that the forum required users to keep their characters "active," as inactive characters would be deleted from the forum. To ensure compliance with this rule, the forum monitored user's activity levels, and sent users periodic activity reports.
- 35. Below is an example of how the moderators of Murders & Roses communicated with users about monthly activity reports:

Subject: Murders and Roses

THE JANUARY ACTIVITY CHECK at murders and roses is currently underway. Please be aware that if you do not reply to the activity check, have not made a new thread since last October or do not let us know that you intend to return, your account will be deleted. To ensure the continuation of murders and roses Roleplay forum, this is necessary.

Thanks, Karrie Moderator

36. Users of the forum were permitted to select from certain canonical characters, including those identified in the above advertisement, for their plotting exercises, but the forum also encouraged users to create original characters. As part

of the forum process, users were required to post a description of their characters, including a description of their age, gender, sexual orientation, occupation, eye color, hair color and style, body type, attire, personality, family members, and history. Users were also required to select an actor or actress who would be cast to play the character in a motion picture or television series. Once a user submitted this information about a new, original character, it was subject to approval by the moderators before the character could be included in the forum. The rules of Murders & Roses encouraged users to "be creative" and to "think up . . . good [secrets]" for their characters.

37. Upon information and belief, the Murders & Roses forum first came into existence in or around April 2010.

Biani Joins Murders & Roses and Creates Her Original Characters

- 38. Biani joined the Murders & Roses forum in January 2011 and began to develop characters for the theme of the forum. Between 2011 and 2013, Biani made more than one thousand posts to Murders & Roses and developed at least fifteen original characters over this time.
- 39. On January 31, 2011, Biani posted to Murders & Roses a description of a new character, named Charlotte Emilie Benoit. In her description of Charlotte, Biani provided all the details and characteristics required by the forum, including those relating to her physical appearance, personality, and history, as well as the actor who would best portray her.
- 40. Biani described Charlotte's physical appearance and characteristics as follows:

| Age | 31 |
|-------------|-----------------------------|
| Gender | Female |
| Orientation | Omnisexual |
| Occupation | Assassin |
| Job | Self-acclaimed witch doctor |

- 12 -

:

Case 2:23-cv-03845 Document 1 Filed 05/18/23 Page 13 of 31 Page ID #:13

| Eye Color: | Cobalt | |
|-----------------------|--|--|
| Hair Color & Style | ir Color Dark brown, slightly wavy, long Style | |
| Body Type | Slim, 5'6" | |
| Attire | Mostly she is seen in 1880s outfit with a matching jacket and skirt, high-collared shirt and a veiled top hat. For more special occasions, extravagant gowns with low-cut décolletages are her preference. Furthermore, seeing that there is no law that forbids wearing male attire, she dresses like a man every now and then. With the knowledge that people bear with her because eof her valuable special skills, she does not care that cross-dressing gives birth to rumors about her disreputable character. | |

41. Biani described Charlotte's personality as follows:

Personality:

2.5

Persistent & Positive: Whenever she sets her mind onto something, she never gives up until the task is fully achieved. Accordingly, she has developed wonderful patience from it. Even if it takes years for her to fulfill whatever she desires, she will strive for it relentlessly with the same enthusiastic zeal she possessed the first day of that particular aspiration. Staying positive about everything has proved her to bring her wishes to actualization. She always makes sure she gets whatever she wants in one way or another.

Seductive & Controlling: Self-confident, but not conceited. She knows she is beautiful, but does not talk about it. She uses her charms to manipulate people into acquiescing to her ideas. Whenever arguments burst out and she is unable to bring opposers to her side, she tends to deal with the obstacle by extirpating the opponent from earth. In better cases, whenever she succeeds entangling the victim in her influential web, she becomes extremely demanding and treats her admirers like slaves in a way where they are unable to notice it.

Feminist & Rebellious: "There must be equal rights for men and women", is her doctrine. Witnessing men belittling, disrespecting or taking advantage of women's fragility, can instantly demolish her cunning, sneaky act; and instead of planning on how to quietly kill the man, she might leap to him and tear his face off. Of course, just like every other human sometimes her emotions get the best of her. Being submissive is a state she has never experienced and never wishes to experience. If someone asks her to do something, she will do the complete opposite, only because she does not wish to comply with anyone's request.

Ladylike & Gentlemanly: She is pretty courteous, feminine and well-mannered, only because she has to gain people's trust and endear herself to them. Though, sometimes, she gets fed up with the nauseating customs and loudly announces her oddity in public by wearing a man's attire, behaving like a gentleman, smoking, and taking part in activities that are not meant for women.

Cold-Hearted & Delusional: She never feels remorse after her homicides, no matter whether the victims are men, women, elderly or young. Seeing that she commits murders for the idea that the earth needs to be cleansed from the people who are spiritually too retarded, she sees nothing wrong in her unlawful deeds.

Debauched & Wicked: Charlotte is perverted to the extreme. She has a strange habit of being over-protective and clingy toward newly matured boys and girls of late teens. But thanks to her sick mind, she can't help tainting them by introducing the innocent to sensual world. Once they become deprayed, she loses interest in them and searches for other innocent beings to corrupt.

Generous & Helpful: Putting all of her abnormalities aside, she loves helping her patients/customers, not because it makes her feel better about herself, but because she actually loves to see people in high spirits. She will always help those who never ask her for it, and who do not belong to her "list of imbeciles".

42. In her description of Charlotte's history, Biani described Charlotte as "a somewhat mentally disturbed child" as reflected in her "compulsive obsession [with] fairly tales with dark scenarios, which soon developed into the fanaticism of occult." Charlotte was "[i]nfatuated by the idea of witchery" and in her early years "the little pale brunette perpetually stole magic books from anyone and anywhere she could." As she grew up, "Charlotte became more aware of the injustices in the suffocating image of the proper role of women, so-called 'feminine ideal.' It was then she made

- 14 -

a vow within herself to fight for the rights of her gender for the rest of her life." Charlotte ultimately assumed the identity of a "witch doctor":

Her years of studying green witchcraft came in handy. After roaming around England for years, she became known for her magical healing abilities. The secret behind her white magic is as simple as it gets – a good knowledge of herbs and the power of positive energy.

As for the actor who would portray Charlotte, Biani selected Eva Green:



{Charlotte Émilie Benoit}

Age: [/color] 31 Gender: Female

Orientation: Omnisexual Occupation: Assassin

Job: Self-Acclaimed Witch Doctor

Needed Character/ Themes claim: None

Play By: Eva Green

The moderators ("Dorian Gray" and "Lord Charles Carmichael") 44. approved Biani's Charlotte character and expressly noted her distinctive nature and originality:

Post by DORIAN GRAY on Jan 31, 2011 at 2:27pm

Very interesting character! Pretty original as well, we do not have anyone like her around for the moment, but still believable in our Victorian era. I think this application is perfectly acceptable, just wait for Charles' opinion and you're on!

BENOIT, Charlotte Émilie Feb 5, 2011 at 3:37am
Post by LORD CHARLES CARMICHAEL on Feb 5, 2011 at 3:37am accepted

I agree with Dorian and I'm really curious to see her be part of the forum plot!

- 15 -

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

26 27

- 45. On May 22, 2011, Biani submitted for approval by the moderators a description of a new character named Frederick FitzClarence. In her description of Frederick, Biani described him as an "imposter" "[c]onstantly seeking reassurance and approval" and prone to being "inappropriately sexually provocative," including by "ceremoniously smoothing a complete stranger" or "undressing in public and making up some sort of a ridiculous excuse for it." He is also described as prone to "seizures" and "dark thoughts" that he has experienced "since he was a little boy." "According to the priests, Frederick is the devil's child," which is "how they explain why bad luck haunts nearly everyone who spend[s] more than three days" with him.
- 46. Biani's description of Frederick's history describes the following events:

[O]ne day, when [Frederick and a priest] were walking in the garden of FitzClarence mansion, Freddie collapsed on the ground and underwent a Grand-mal seizure. The sight frightened the priest to such extremes that his one-track mind deduced that Frederick was possessed by evil spirts, if not demons. Once the family was informed about Frederick's unearthly condition, the boy was locked in the house to 'protect innocent citizen[s] from him.'

The priests visited him every other day in an effort to exorcize Frederick. But to no avail. During prayers, Freddy simply stared at them in amusement, until he got bored or cracked up at their idiocy. His siblings were forbidden to see him. Even his parents tended to avoid him as much as they could in fear of being haunted by a bad luck. Only nannies, who were not told about his condition, were the ones who interacted with him.

Disregarded and nearly forgotten by the entire family, as time went by Frederick developed a histrionic personality disorder. At the age of 15, Frederick slept with one of the nurses, who was much older than him. The disgraceful event' (as they called it) brought a tumult in the FitzClarence manor. Now the priests, who knew about him, deemed him to be an Antichrist who had come to earth to bring as much evil as possible.

47.

nineteen, his uncle took Frederick into his care and moved him to London. There, Frederick returned to his "old hobby" of acting as an impostor around others, for two reasons: "One, because he is afraid that they would avoid him if they find out who he really is. And two, because he loves to attract as much attention as possible. But somewhere in those acts, he has lost himself. He is uncertain of what are his real likes, dislikes, wants and interests." Frederick is also described by Biani as an expert marksman: He was "a frequent participant in archery, knife throwing and firearm shooting competition." Indeed, his "deadly precision and inhumanly fast draws of the pistol attracted several generals' attention," but alas his seizures prevented him from enlisting in the military.

Biani's description of Frederick's history states that when Frederick was

- 48. The moderators approved Biani's Frederick character on May 22, 2011, noting that the character description was "amazing and well done," and that Frederick was "[v]ery interesting" and "different from" Biani's other characters.
- 49. In March 2011, Biani posted a description of a new character named Landon Otis Lloyd. Biani described Landon as an "explorer" who lives a "nomadic lifestyle, constantly traveling from one country to another to learn about different cultures, humans, animals," including the African continent. In appearance, Landon "wears his brown pinstripe sack coat and pinstripe pants, white dress shirt, tawny vest, coffee colored leather shoes and bowler hat, black tie and gold pocket watch." Landon has a power of "clairvoyance" and "[h]is dreams often tell him something about [. . .] future events." This power is attributed to "his near death experience when he got lost in the forest as a child."
- 50. Biani described Landon as deciding leave his nomadic existence and settle in London, where he assumes the occupation of private investigator, using his powers of clairvoyance to help him solve mysteries. He embarks on a new mission in London, "to find his long lost half-sister, Irene Adler." Indeed, she becomes

"[t]he reason" he settles in London "even though he hates to stay in the same place for too long" – "because of his mission to find his sibling."

51. The moderators approved Biani's original Landon character on March 19, 2011, noting that Biani had taken the "time and effort to build up something really good."

Penny Dreadful Airs in 2014

- 52. In 2013, Showtime announced work on a new series that would eventually become *Penny Dreadful*, written by John Logan. In July 2013, Showtime announced that Eva Green had been cast to play a lead role. Penny Dreadful premiered on Showtime On Demand and other platforms in the United States in April and May 2014.
- 53. Penny Dreadful tells the story of Vanessa Ives, played by Eva Green, who is a Victorian-era woman living in London whose struggle with her inner evil forms the basic conflict of the show. Like Charlotte, Vanessa is portrayed as a powerful woman with a seductive, alluring presence who is schooled in the social graces of the time, yet rebels against them. Over the course of the series, Vanessa interacts with a number of canonical characters, including Dorian Gray, Victor Frankenstein and his Monster, and Count Dracula, but her relationship with Sir Malcolm Murray forms the key story in the series.
- 54. Like Landon Lloyd, Sir Malcom is a professional explorer who has returned to London to find his missing family member, his daughter Mina. Sir Malcolm and Vanessa have known each other since Vanessa was a young girl, as the Ives and Murray families were neighbors and Vanessa and Mina were best friends. Yet, their relationship was fractured after Vanessa witnessed Sir Malcolm having sex with Vanessa's mother. In retaliation, Vanessa seduced Mina's fiancé on the eve of their wedding, an event that occurred just before Mina disappeared. These events tragically unite Vanessa and Sir Malcolm, and Sir Malcolm draws upon the guilt that Vanessa experiences over them to enlist her help finding Mina.

Vanessa descended into a deep darkness during which she appeared to be visited by evil forces. Like Frederick, Vanessa experienced episodes of seizures that lead others around her to believe she was possessed by demons and other evil spirits. Like Frederick, Vanessa was institutionalized for treatment but never cured of her inner evil and continued to struggle to understand the conflicts within her. Sir Malcolm enlists Vanessa's help to find Mina because Vanessa is endowed with strange and mysterious powers: like Landon, Vanessa has the power of clairvoyance – she is a medium who can reveal past and future; like Charlotte, she is a witch and herbalist, who can martial the magical powers of plants and nature. Together, Vanessa and Sir Malcolm, assisted by other canonical and non-canonical characters, search for Mina, as Vanessa searches to understand her own internal conflict and ultimately retain her faith in good over evil.

56. *Penny Dreadful* aired on Showtime over three seasons from 2014 to 2016, and remains available for viewing today on numerous platforms, including Apple TV®, Roku®, Amazon Prime Video®, and Google Play®.

///

- 19 -

Similarities Between Biani's Original Characters and Penny Dreadful

1

2

3

4

28

The character of Vanessa Ives is substantially and/or strikingly similar 57. to the original characters created by Biani for Murders & Roses. Among the similarities are the following:

| 5 | | Charlotte Benoit | Vanessa Ives (Penny |
|----|---------------------------------|--|--|
| 6 | | | Dreadful) |
| 7 | Appearance | • 31 year old female | • "She's beautiful. Almost |
| 8 | and Physical Characteristics | • "Mostly she is seen in | strangely so. Pale, pale skin and raven hair. |
| 9 | | 1880s outfit with a matching jacket and skirt, | She's in her late 20's. |
| 10 | | high-collared shirt and a | Enigmatic, haunted eyes, and utterly composed. |
| 11 | | veiled top hat. For special occasions, extravagant | She will prove herself a force to be reckoned |
| 12 | | gowns with low-cut décolletages are her | with. Our heroine."3 |
| 13 | | preference." | • "She is poised, |
| 14 | | • "Pale brunette." | mysterious, and utterly composed. Vanessa is a |
| 15 | | • "She knows she is | seductive and formidable |
| 16 | | beautiful She uses her charms to manipulate | beauty full of secrets and danger." ⁴ |
| 17 | | people into acquiescing to | danger. |
| 18 | | her ideas." | |
| 19 | | | |
| 20 | | | |
| 21 | | | The The |
| 22 | | | |
| 23 | | | |
| 24 | | | |
| 25 | | {Charlotte Émilie Benoit} | |
| 26 | | | |
| 27 | | | |

³ https://www.sho.com/penny-dreadful/cast/vanessa-ives/https://penny-dreadful.fandom.com/wiki/Vanessa_Ives#

- 20 -

| Personality • "Seductive and controlling" • "Feminist and rebellious" yet also "ladylike and gentlemanly" • "Cold-hearted," "debauched and wicked" • Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public • Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies • Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs Frederick FitzClarence Frederick FitzClarence Wanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | | | | |
|---|----|-------------|-------------------------|--|
| Personality • "Seductive and controlling" • "Feminist and rebellious" yet also "ladylike and gentlemanly" • "Cold-hearted," "debauched and wicked" • Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public • Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies • Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs Frederick FitzClarence Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Ensodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 1 | | | |
| Personality • "Seductive and controlling" • "Feminist and rebellious" yet also "ladylike and gentlemanly" • "Cold-hearted," "debauched and wicked" • Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public • Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies • Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs Frederick FitzClarence Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Ensodes of seizures during with evil evil evil evil evil evil evil evil | 2 | | | A TREATMENT OF THE PARTY OF THE |
| Personality "Seductive and controlling" "Feminist and rebellious yet also "ladylike and gentlemanly" "Cold-hearted," "debauched and wicked" Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot *Reserved, intelligent and kind, yet also a seductress with a powerful sexuality who is hauted by her relationship to evil A strong Victorian woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including smoking cannabis Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless *A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot *A conditional powers of herbalism and tarot *A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot *Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil *Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including sending to conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including sending to conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including sending to conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including sending to conduct not typical of a woman o | 3 | | | |
| "Feminist and rebellious" yet also "ladylike and gentlemanly" "Cold-hearted," "debauched and wicked" Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities Abilities Abilities Abilities Perederick FitzClarence Prederick is prone to seizures and plagued by "Feminist and rebellious" yet also a seductress with a powerful sexuality who is haunted by her relationship to evil A strong Victorian woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including smoking cannabis Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Prederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) Preadful Prederick is prone to seizures and plagued by | 4 | | | |
| Frederick FitzClarence Seductress with a powerful sexuality who is haunted by her relationship to evil | 5 | Personality | | |
| gentlemanly" "Cold-hearted," "debauched and wicked" Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities Abilities A strong Victorian woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including smoking cannabis Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless Special Abilities A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs Frederick FitzClarence Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Special Abilities Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by | 6 | | | <u>-</u> |
| "Cold-hearted," "debauched and wicked" Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs Frederick FitzClarence Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Engages in actions not typical of a Woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including smoking cannabis Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 7 | | | - |
| • Engages in actions not typical of a Victorian woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including smoking cannabis in public • Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies • Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities • A strong Victorian woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including smoking cannabis • Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless • A strong Victorian woman who engages in conduct not typical of a woman of the era, including smoking cannabis • Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless • A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 8 | | , | J |
| typical of a Victorian woman, such as smoking cannabis in public Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities Abilities Abilities Abilities Abilities Sexually aggressive and corrupting Abilities Abilities Frederick FitzClarence Trederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Typical of a Victorian woman of the era, including smoking cannabis Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Frederick is prone to seizures with evil | 9 | | | _ |
| woman, such as smoking cannabis in public Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities Abilities Abilities Frederick FitzClarence Frederick FitzClarence Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Woman of the era, including smoking cannabis Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by communes with evil | 10 | | | |
| • Generous and courteous, yet at the same time capable of evil and homicidal tendencies • Sexually aggressive and corrupting • Sexually aggressive and corrupting balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs • A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot • Frederick FitzClarence • Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 11 | | woman, such as smoking | woman of the era, |
| 13 14 15 16 16 17 18 19 20 20 3 3 4 Abilities 21 22 23 24 25 4 History 27 Frederick FitzClarence Selection and homicidal tendencies and contraction of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting • Despite being schooled in social graces, Vanessa is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs • A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 12 | | - | |
| of evil and homicidal tendencies Sexually aggressive and corrupting Sexually aggressive and corrupting Special Abilities Abilities Abilities Frederick FitzClarence Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Special tendencies Sexually aggressive and tendencies is disdainful of the rituals of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Special Abilities Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) Frederick is prone to seizures during which she communes with evil | 13 | | | |
| • Sexually aggressive and corrupting • Sexually aggressive and corrupting • Sexually aggressive and corrupting of serving tea, maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs • A witch learned in the arts of herbalism and tarot Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 14 | | of evil and homicidal | in social graces, Vanessa |
| Sexually aggressive and corrupting maintaining decorum at balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless | 15 | | | |
| balls and engaging in light social banter, all of which she finds tedious and meaningless Special Abilities • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs Frederick FitzClarence Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 16 | | | , |
| Special Abilities | 17 | | | |
| Special Abilities • A "green witch" with a knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 18 | | | |
| Abilities knowledge of the magical healing powers of herbs arts of herbalism and tarot Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) History • Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by during which she communes with evil | 19 | | | and meaningless |
| healing powers of herbs tarot healing powers of herbs tarot Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) History • Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by during which she communes with evil | 20 | _ | | |
| Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) History Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) • Frederick is prone to during which she communes with evil | 21 | Abilities | | |
| Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) History Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Seizures and plagued by Communes with evil | 22 | | | |
| Frederick FitzClarence Vanessa Ives (Penny Dreadful) History Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by Seizures and plagued by Communes with evil | 23 | | | |
| Dreadful) History Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by by Dreadful) Frederick is prone to during which she communes with evil | 24 | | | |
| History • Frederick is prone to seizures and plagued by • Episodes of seizures during which she communes with evil | 25 | | Frederick FitzClarence | \ \ |
| seizures and plagued by during which she communes with evil | 26 | History | • Frederick is prone to | , |
| 28 communes with evil | 27 | | seizures and plagued by | during which she |
| | 28 | | | communes with evil |

- 21 -

| 1 | "dark thoughts" from an | spirits from the |
|----|---|---|
| 2 | early age. | otherworld lead Vanessa to be institutionalized in |
| 3 | • It is thought that he is | an asylum and |
| 4 | possessed by demons, which leads to him being | lobotomized. |
| 5 | placed in the care of priests; | · · |
| 6 | the priests ultimately conclude that he is an | |
| 7 | "Antichrist who had come to earth to bring as much | her and retain her faith in her true self-identity is the |
| 8 | evil as possible." | basic conflict in <i>Penny</i> |
| 9 | • The source of his dark | Dreadful. |
| 10 | thoughts and his true | |
| 11 | identity remain a mystery to Frederick as he leads the life | |
| 12 | of an imposter: "But | |
| 13 | somewhere in those acts, he has lost himself. He is | |
| 14 | uncertain of what are his | |
| 15 | real likes, dislikes, wants and interests." | |
| 16 | and interests. | |

| | Landon Lloyd | Vanessa Ives (<i>Penny</i> <i>Dreadful</i>) |
|----------------------|--------------------------|--|
| Special Abilities | Clairvoyance/premonition | A medium with the power of clairvoyance |

Defendants' Access to Biani's Works

58. Upon information and belief, Defendants Does 1 and 2 had access to Biani's protected works as the moderators of Murders & Roses. Among other things, they expressly approved Biani's original characters as a condition of the inclusion of those characters in the Murders & Roses forum.

- 59. Upon information and belief, Showtime, Logan, and Nevins, or persons acting as their agents and/or at their direction or under their control, including through Does 1 and 2, had access to Biani's works on Murders & Roses.
- 60. Upon information belief, Defendants accessed Biani's original, protected works on Murders & Roses before the Vanessa Ives and Sir Malcolm Murray characters of *Penny Dreadful* were conceived and there are substantial similarities between Biani's original characters and Vanessa Ives of *Penny Dreadful*.
- 61. As described herein, there are striking similarities between Biani's original characters and Vanessa Ives of *Penny Dreadful*.
- 62. Evidence of access includes but is not limited to the substantial similarity between Biani's protected works and *Penny Dreadful*. Other evidence of access includes similarities between other characters and elements of Biani's writings on Murders & Roses, such as an original character created by Biani named William Talbot, who is a lanky, vampire-like servant who assists Charlotte in disposing of corpses, and the *Penny Dreadful* character Fenton, a rabid, vampire's familiar captured by Sir Malcolm at the London Zoo who mysteriously knows Vanessa and her dark past.
- 63. Additional evidence of access includes the substantial and/or striking similarities between Biani's character Landon Lloyd, notably his appearance and history, and the *Penny Dreadful* character Sir Malcolm Murray.

Defendants' Infringing Acts

64. Plaintiff is the owner of valid copyrights in the characters of Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon. Among other things, each of Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon possess consistent, identifiable and unique character traits and attributes that make them well-delineated and subject to copyright protection. For example, as described herein, Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon possess both distinctive physical and distinctive conceptual qualities and unique elements of expression. Charlotte's physical description is well-defined and goes so far as to include a graphical image

of Charlotte and her personality includes specific and distinctive character traits that are atypical of the time, such as smoking cannabis in public. Similarly paragraph 57 describes how Frederick is, for example, prone to seizures, possessed by demons, and is plagued by uncertainty as to his self-identity as he leads the life of an imposter.

- 65. Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon are substantially delineated, for example, because the above character traits described in at least paragraph 57 are reflected across Plaintiff's copyrightable works. Among other things, Charlotte's desire to be recognized for her healing powers and her unorthodox impact on others remains a consistent theme in Biani's plots. On her journey, Charlotte seduces Dr. Frankenstein to gain his allegiance and knowledge, introduces a young girl to cannabis cigarettes, and attempts to seduce her as well, and offers to help a maid cure her sister's mysterious illness before giving in to her homicidal tendencies instead. In each of these plots, Charlotte comprises the story being told. By way of another example, Frederick, whether conversing with the admirable Lord Ashdown or the sly and seductive Josephine Parker, continuously worries about being found out as an imposter or not being the focus of their attention.
- 66. Biani's characters also comprise the very "story being told" by Biani's works on Murders & Roses. Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon are more than the vessel of a story, but are the very heart of the Plaintiff's stories. Indeed, Biani's characters were developed in the context of a forum in which the whole purpose was to develop a character that would then interact with other characters. In such a forum, the characters and their relationships necessarily predominate over plot, which, if anything, was a vehicle to develop the characters further. Plaintiff's copyright protected expressions focus on Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon, and their relationships and interactions with other characters rather than a story independent of characters. For example, Charlotte, seeing an opportunity to make a name for her healing powers and a potential ally offers to help a maid cure her sister of a

- 24 -

mysterious illness, before Charlotte gives in to her more homicidal tendencies and makes a failed attempt on the younger sister's life.

- 67. Plaintiff has not licensed to Defendants the right to use her copyrighted characters in any manner, nor has Plaintiff assigned any of her exclusive rights in the copyrights to Defendants.
- 68. Without permission or authorization from Plaintiff, and in willful violation of Plaintiff's rights under 17 U.S.C. § 106, Defendants improperly and illegally copied, reproduced, distributed, and adapted works copyrighted by Plaintiff, thereby infringing Plaintiff's exclusive copyrights in her protected works.
- 69. Showtime has aired Penny Dreadful since 2014, comprising hundreds of broadcasts. It is unknown how many times *Penny Dreadful* has been streamed by customers on its streaming service SHOWTIME®. Showtime also continues to distribute the trailer and promotional materials for Penny Dreadful on its website, Showtime.com, which incorporate elements of Plaintiff's protected works.

STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS TOLLING/CONTINUING VIOLATIONS

- 70. Plaintiff did not learn of Defendants' unauthorized use of her protected works until May 18, 2020, when she first became aware of *Penny Dreadful*. Upon discovery of Defendants' infringing acts, Plaintiff took steps to investigate her claims and commence this action.
- 71. In any event, Defendants' acts of infringement are ongoing and continue to this day, including by publicly displaying and streaming *Penny Dreadful* via SHOWTIME ON DEMAND® and via third party video streaming services such as Apple TV®, Roku®, Amazon Prime Video®, and Google Play®.

FIRST CLAIM FOR RELIEF

(Direct Copyright Infringement, 17 U.S.C. § 101, et seq.—Against Showtime, Logan And Nevins)

72. Plaintiff incorporates by reference each and every allegation contained in Paragraphs 1 through 71, inclusive, of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.

- 73. Plaintiff is, and at all relevant times has been, the owner of a valid copyright in and to her original characters Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon, including material associated with Copyright Registration Nos. TX0009259135, TX0009259151, TX0009259146, TX0009262305, TX000926858, TX0009262879, TX0009262872, TX0009262877, TX0009262886, and TX0009262867.
- 74. Through their conduct alleged herein, Showtime, Logan and Nevins have infringed Plaintiff's copyright in her original characters. For example, by knowingly copying Plaintiff's original characters as the basis for lead characters in the television show *Penny Dreadful*, by accessing Plaintiff's works and using substantially similar lead characters, and/or by using strikingly similar lead characters. Defendants publicly exhibited Penny Dreadful on various cable television channels, including their network SHOWTIME®, and permitted streaming of *Penny Dreadful* on the Internet and via third party video stand-alone streaming services such as Apple TV®, Roku®, Amazon Prime Video®, and Google Play®, without authorization in violation of the Copyright Act, 17 U.S.C. §§ 101, *et seq*. The aforesaid conduct of Showtime, Logan and Nevins is without the consent or permission of Plaintiff.
- 75. Showtime, Logan and Nevins have realized unjust profits, gains, and advantages as a proximate result of their infringement as long as such infringement is permitted to continue.
- 76. Plaintiff is entitled to recover from Showtime, Logan and Nevins the amount of actual damages incurred as a result of the infringement under 17 U.S.C. § 504, in such amount as shown by appropriate evidence, and the profits derived by Showtime, Logan and Nevins as a result of their infringing activities.
- 77. Alternatively, at Plaintiff's election, Plaintiff is entitled to the maximum statutory damages pursuant to 17 U.S.C. § 504(c) for each infringement.
- 78. Plaintiff is also entitled to recover attorney's fees and costs of suit pursuant to 17 U.S.C. § 505.

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

SECOND CLAIM FOR RELIEF

(Contributory Copyright Infringement—Against DOES 1 and 2)

- Plaintiff incorporates by reference each and every allegation contained 79. in Paragraphs 1 through 78, inclusive, of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 80. As set forth above, Showtime has infringed and continue to infringe Plaintiff's copyright in and to her original characters Charlotte, Frederick, and Landon, including material associated with Copyright Registration Nos. TX0009259135, TX0009259151, TX009259146, TX0009262305, TX000926858, TX0009262879, TX0009262872, TX0009262877, TX0009262886, and TX0009262867.
- 81. Upon information and belief, DOES 1 and 2 are aware of Showtime's infringement of Plaintiff's rights in her original characters through the television show Penny Dreadful.
- Upon information and belief, DOES 1 and 2 have knowingly and 82. intentionally induced, caused, and/or materially contributed to the infringement of Plaintiff's exclusive rights in and to the copyright to her original characters by, *inter* alia, providing the other Defendants with access to Plaintiff's protected works for the purpose of knowingly inducing and enabling those Defendant's to infringe Plaintiff's copyright.
- DOES 1 and 2's acts of contributory infringement were willful, in 83. disregard of, and with indifference to, Plaintiff's rights.
- By reason of the actions and contributory copyright infringement of 84. DOES 1 and 2, Plaintiff has sustained and will continue to sustain substantial injury, loss, and damage therefrom.
- As a direct and proximate result of these acts of contributory copyright 85. infringement, Plaintiff is entitled to actual damages and DOES 1 and 2's's profits derived from the infringement or, alternatively, the maximum statutory damages with respect to each infringement copyright pursuant to 17 U.S.C. § 504(c).

| 1 | 86. Plaintiff is additionally entitled to attorney's fees pursuant to 17 U | S.C |
|----|---|---------|
| 2 | § 505. | |
| 3 | THIRD CLAIM FOR RELIEF | |
| 4 | (Declaratory Judgment) | |
| 5 | 87. Plaintiff incorporates by reference each and every allegation cont | ained |
| 6 | in Paragraphs 1 through 86, inclusive, of this Complaint as if fully set forth her | ein. |
| 7 | 88. An actual, present, and justiciable controversy has arisen and of | exists |
| 8 | between Plaintiff and Defendants. | |
| 9 | 89. Plaintiff requests a declaration of rights and ownership with response | ect to |
| 10 | her copyrighted material. | |
| 11 | 90. Plaintiff requests a declaratory judgment that she is the creator | r and |
| 12 | owner of her original characters, and that these characters served as the direct | |
| 13 | inspiration and basis for central characters in the television series <i>Penny Dreadful</i> . | |
| 14 | FOURTH CLAIM FOR RELIEF | |
| 15 | (Accounting—Against SHOWTIME) | |
| 16 | 91. Plaintiff incorporates by reference each and every allegation cont | ainec |
| 17 | in Paragraphs 1 through 90, inclusive, of this Complaint as if fully set forth her | ein. |
| 18 | 92. As alleged, Showtime has reproduced, used, distributed, broadcast | ed on |
| 19 | cable networks, and streamed on the internet Plaintiff's copyrighted ori | gina |
| 20 | characters through the television show Penny Dreadful without Plain | ıtiff's |
| 21 | permission. | |
| 22 | 93. The exact number of times Showtime has broadcasted and/or stre | amec |
| 23 | Penny Dreadful is unknown to Plaintiff, and so are the profits accumulated by | such |
| 24 | infringing acts, which can be determined only by an accounting. | |
| 25 | 94. For the reasons herein stated, Plaintiff's request for an accounting | g and |
| 26 | damages in accordance therewith is justified. | |
| 27 | PRAYER FOR RELIEF | |
| 28 | | |

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff demands judgment against the Defendants, and each of them, as follows:

- 1. That this Court adjudge that Showtime, Logan and Nevins have infringed Plaintiff's copyright in her original characters;
- 2. That this Court adjudge that DOES 1 and 2 materially contributed to the infringement of Plaintiff's copyright of her original characters and have therefore contributorily infringed Plaintiff's copyright;
- 3. Award Plaintiff, at her election, either (i) actual damages and the profits derived by Defendants, and each of them, as a result of their infringing activities, or (ii) statutory damages in the maximum amount permitted under applicable law with respect to Plaintiff's infringed copyright pursuant to 17 U.S.C. § 504;
- 4. For a declaration by the Court that Plaintiff is the creator and owner of her original characters and that these characters were copied and served as the inspiration and bases for characters central to the television show Penny Dreadful;
- 5. That Showtime be ordered to furnish to Plaintiff a complete and accurate accounting of all profits earned in connection with their unauthorized exploitation and use of her original characters through the television show *Penny Dreadful*;
- 6. That judgment be entered against Defendants, jointly and severally, for Plaintiff's costs and attorney's fees pursuant to 17 U.S.C. §§ 101, et seq.;
 - 7. Prejudgment and post-judgment interest; and
- 8. That the Court grant Plaintiff such other and further relief as it deems just and equitable to make Plaintiff whole for the damage caused by Defendants.

Dated: May 18, 2023 WHITE & CASE LLP

| 1 | By: <u>/s/Michael Songer</u> _ |
|----------|---|
| 2 | Michael Songer |
| 3 | michael.songer@whitecase.com WHITE & CASE LLP 701 Thirteenth Street, NW |
| 4 | Washington, DC 20006 Telephone: (202) 626-3600 Facsimile: (202) 639-9355 |
| 5 | |
| 6 | Sebastian Zonte sebastian.zonte@whitecase.com |
| 7 | WHITE & CASÉ LLP 555 S. Flower St., Ste. 2700 |
| 8 | Los Angeles, CA 90071 Telephone: (213) 620-7798 Facsimile: (213) 678-0758 |
| 9 | |
| 10 | Hallie E. Kiernan hallie.kiernan@whitecase.com WHITE & CASE LLP |
| 11 | 1221 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10020 |
| 12 | Telephone: (212) 819-8200 Facsimile: (212) 354-8113 |
| 13 | Attorneys for ANNA BIANI |
| 14 | |
| 15 16 | |
| 17 | |
| 18 | |
| 19 | |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |
| 26 | |
| 27 | |
| 28 | |

JURY DEMAND Plaintiff Anna Biani respectfully requests a jury trial on all issues triable set forth in this Complaint. Dated: May 18, 2023 WHITE & CASE LLP By: /s/Michael Songer_ Michael Songer Attorney for ANNA BIANI

- 31 -